

MUNICIPALITY

Formation of the evaluation of the independent expert

I. Introduction: Implementation of Stage I of the Methodology for Assessment of municipalities candidate obtaining the European label

Innovation and Good Governance at Local Level **III. Data:** is set by MRRB

III. Information about the municipality: Are provided by the municipality by the third procedure for awarding the Label.

IV. Information about the municipality

- Result from a survey of councilors: **3,34**
- Result from a survey of citizens of the municipality: **2,90**
- Evidence is systematized in indicators and principles. The municipality did not calculate well their results in summary matrix.
- Self-assessment of the municipality of summary matrix at the end of the standard: **3,60**

Principle	Indicators by principles	Conclusion on evidence	assessment community	Assessment municipalities council	Assessment citizens	Conclusions for applying the principles
1. Honest elections, representativeness and civil participation	1. The municipality conducts elections under laws that meet international standards of good practice.	conclusively proven	4,00			YES=CP 7CP+3PI+ 1U = 11
	As part of a clear process of consultation, the municipality actively publish its plans and invites citizens and non-governmental organizations, businesses, local media and other groups to comment on these plans.	conclusively proven	4,00			
	3. The municipality aims to improve local regulations and practical arrangements concerning citizens' participation in local public life.	proven inconclusive				
	4. The opinion of the public is looking for from the beginning of the process of decision making.	Proven inconclusive	4,00			
	5. There is an active program of elected representatives engaging citizens in decision-making.	Proven inconclusive.	3,00			

	6. an active program is applied to encourage citizens to participate in elections.	Unproven	4,00			
	7. Access to voting is discussed and actions taken will be excluded groups or those at a disadvantage.	conclusively proven				
	8. There is an active program to include other groups, including the disadvantaged, in decision-making.	conclusively proven	0,00			
	9. The municipality has identified key stakeholder groups (including non-governmental organizations, businesses, local media and other interest groups). This list is subject to revision and updating.	conclusively proven	4,00			
	10. The municipality introduced techniques consultative process (advisory hearing civil jury participation in budgeting, etc.).	conclusively proven	3,00			
	11. Decisions are taken according to the will of the majority while respecting the rights and legitimate interests of the minority.	conclusively proven	3,00			
3,00						
4,00						
			3,27	3,55	2,93	
2Respon siveness	1. 1. There are clear guidelines and procedures for officials and elected representatives in all processes of decision-making.	conclusively proven	4,00			Yes/No=P I 3CP+3PI = 6
	2. The municipality ensure that all elected representatives Rade for the interests of local people.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	3. Developed and implemented a separate procedure for complaints related to the operation of local public services and bodies with a certain response time and there is evidence that it is used.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	4. Information relating to complaints filed with the municipality and the answers to the complaints,	conclusively proven	4,00			

	including those resulting changes are made available to employees, elected representatives and citizens.					
	5. If there are necessary changes in policy and service delivery, they are made as a result of studies, reports, consultations, complaints and other methods to study the opinion of citizens. Changes will be made.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	6. The municipality provides good care for "customers" by ensuring that services are provided by educated and well-trained employees who understand the needs of citizens.	conclusively proven	4,00			
			4,00	3,35	3,03	
3. Effectiveness and efficiencies	1. The municipality plans its activities and budget in line with its strategic plans for the strategic and operational levels.	conclusively proven	4,00			Yes=CP 6CP+3PI = 9
	2. Regularly collect and reviews information on the implementation. Municipality makes action to deal with differences between expected and actual performance.	conclusively proven	4,00			
	3. The Municipality shall develop and implement a framework for performance management, which covers all of its goals, services and features, including appropriate indicators and report regularly on its implementation and its progress.	Proven inconclusive	4,00			
	4. The municipalities share best practices with other municipalities, and uses this information to improve its own efficiency and effectiveness.	conclusively proven	4,00			
	5. The municipality is developing a document for strategic and operational evaluation of public policies.	conclusively proven	4,00			
	6. The municipality shall take into account the results of its evaluation in the implementation of its future public policies.	conclusively proven	4,00			
	7. The procedures and implementation reports information systems are subject to independent assessment and the results are reported to councilors.	conclusively proven	4,00			
	8. All basic services and functions are assessed	Proven inconclusive				

	periodically at appropriate intervals to assess their performance and impact.		4,00			
	9. The municipality keep adequate documentation to ensure that trends can be identified and the effectiveness and efficiency increase.	Proven inconclusive	3,00			
			3,89	3,40	3,07	
4. Openness and transparency	1. The municipality has a clear and well understood legal framework that is widely publicized.	conclusively proven	4,00			YES=CP 6CP+4PI = 10
	2. The legal base of the municipality includes a clear theme of delegation in decision-making, which defines the responsible parties of any decision and the manner of making, implementation and publication of decisions.	conclusively proven	3,00			
	3. The municipality makes and implements decisions in a way that is open, transparent, responsible and timely in accordance with rules and regulations and consistent with international standards of good practice	conclusively proven	4,00			
	4. There is a procedure for appealing decisions, which widely accessible and understandable	Proven inconclusive.	3,00			
	5. The opposition (municipal council) has the right to make proposals, amendments and requests. The opposition has the right to request meetings of the committees of inquiry in certain topics and have the right to be represented in the structures and management of the municipal council.	conclusively proven	4,00			
	6. The municipality ensures regular and easy contact of citizens with elected representatives	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	7. The municipality actively informing the population.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	8. The meetings of the municipal council are open to the public and the media, and the agenda and documents are publicly available	conclusively proven	4,00			
	9. The municipality has an annual work program for development that takes into account the contribution of citizens and elected representatives and the public.	Conclusively proven	3,00			
	10. Elected representatives show openness to media and	Proven inconclusive.				

	Willingness to give information		4,00			
			3,70	3,20	2,74	
5. Rule of Law	1. Municipality complies with all applicable laws and regulations (regulations).	Conclusively proven	4,00			YES/NO=PI 2CP+2PI = 4
	2. General publicly disclose all sanctions (disputed acts or judgments) for any offenses committed by it.	Proven inconclusive.	3,00			
	3. Rules and regulations shall be adopted in accordance with the procedures prescribed by law.	Conclusively proven	2,00			
	1. Rules and regulations apply impartially.	Proven inconclusive.	3,00			
			3,00	3,40	2,77	
6. ethical behavior	1. Public policies are determined by the role of the municipality in protecting the public interest.	Proven inconclusive.	3,00			YES=CP 5CP+4PI= 9
	2. Local public interests steer the allocation of budgetary resources of the municipality.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	3. Ethical codes stipulate ethical standards expected of elected representatives or officials. They include a requirement in public registers to record interests, gifts and hospitality.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	4. Adopted specific procedures for decision-making in areas that are vulnerable to corruption, including procurement, selling municipal assets and the granting of permits and licenses.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	5. Carry out an annual review of measures to combat corruption, for example by internal or external audit.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	6. Policy for employees who are appointed, promoted and rewarded and / or punished only in accordance with approved procedures.	Conclusively proven	3,00			
	7. Elected representatives and officials are obliged to declare potential conflicts of interest that may affect the decision-making and to refrain from participation in decision-relevant such decisions.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			

	8. The municipality provides effective and efficient procurement and use specify selection criteria.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	9. The municipality provides free access to public procurement documents and decisions concerning the award of the contract.	Conclusively proven	3,00			
			3,67	3,15	3,06	
7. Competence and capacity	1. The municipality determines the skills required for effective delivery of services, and conducts audits of these skills in order to identify gaps as part of the strategic plan for the workforce.	Conclusively proven	4,00			Yes/NO= PI 4CP+4PI = 8
	2. The municipality applies implementation system of personal development plans for employees.	Proven inconclusive.	3,00			
	3. There is a system for motivating employees, to reward excellent performance and improve poor.	Proven inconclusive.	3,00			
	4. The municipality has a policy and procedures for recruitment and selection of personnel, which are public and applied consistently.	Proven inconclusive.	0,00			
	5. There is a developed, implemented and controlled implementation of a training plan to ensure that training needs are fully met and professional skills are constantly evolving to improve the quality of services provided.	Conclusively proven	3,00			
	6. The municipality analyzes the implementation and results of the recruitment, training and promotion, and make the necessary improvements based on the analysis.	Conclusively proven	3,00			
	7. The selection criteria are defined for each office and public. They reflect the basic requirements for work and do not discriminate.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	8. Employees receive regular evaluations on their performance and development as part of a systematic approach to performance evaluation.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
			3,00	3,40	3,11	

8. Innovation and openness to change	1. The municipality has a structured approach to innovation, research and development.	Conclusively proven	4,00			Yes=CP 3CP+1PI = 4
	2. Municipality take action to identify and implement best practices and new solutions.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	3. The municipality has participated in a project for good governance and innovation in the last three years.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	4. Elected representatives and officials are clearly committed to taking action to ensure the benefits of innovation.	Proven inconclusive	0,00			
			3,00	3,10	2,78	
9. Sustainability and long-term orientation	1. The municipality applies a structured approach for the study of leading practices for long-term sustainable development.	Conclusively proven	4,00			Yes=CP 6CP+2PI = 8
	2. The needs of future generations are regularly recorded in the planning process.	Proven inconclusive	4,00			
	3. There is clearly demonstrated commitment of the Municipal Council and Mayor (management team) of the municipality for sustainable local development, which is an integral part of the development of politki and strategies, action planning and setting goals in all departments, functions and services provided.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	4. Young people participate in shaping local policies and strategies in various fields locally.	Proven inconclusive	4,00			
	5. Ensures that municipal processes such as performance management, audit and analysis provide mechanisms for feedback and information on sustainability in practice and implementation.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	6. Applied approach to public participation in decision-making for sustainable development.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	7. Powered investment financial plan that ensures long term viability of the municipal infrastructure and assets.		4,00			
	8. Applied structural approach to preserving the historical, cultural and social values of the municipality	Conclusively proven	4,00			

			4,00	3,40	2,80	
10. Sound financial management	1. Officials clearly define the rationale and basis for the price of services.	Conclusively proven	4,00			Yes/no=P I 7CP+6PI+ 1U = 14
	2. Permanent organizational documents identify the financial responsibilities that apply to all municipal employees.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	3. Internal Audit examines financial operations to ensure compliance with approved internal procedures. Implemented and regularly updated system of financial management and control.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	4. Provide regular reports of officials and elected representatives comparing actual revenue and expenditure budget.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	5. The accounts are audited by persons who are independent of the municipality.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	6. The external audit are made public.	Unproven	4,00			
	7. The annual audit includes examining monetary value (cost, taxes) of services provided by the municipality.	Conclusively proven	3,00			
	8 Accepted annual budgets and multi-annual forecasts before the beginning of the relevant period. Budgets should outline the main estimates for revenue sources and their distribution.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	9. The process of preparing the budget should include active consultation with all interest parties.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	10. The approved budget, tax rates and the annual report including information on the quantity and quality of services shall be made public. Provide public information about the development of the types of services and improving their quality.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	11. All citizens have access to basic indicators of budget and tax rates.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			

	12. The municipality establishes and manages its financial and related to the provision of services risks through one of the following activities: a) identify and manage risks; b) avoiding risks (for example by transferring the business to another legal entity); c) transfer (transfer) risks (eg through public-private partnerships or obtain commercial guarantees) or d) distribution of risks (eg by working in cooperation with another municipality)	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	13. Inter-municipal cooperation is used as a management approach for the development of the municipality.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
	14. The municipality participates in inter-municipal cooperation in order to improve its operation and services for citizens.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			
			3,93	3,20	2,70	
11 Human rights, cultural diversity and social cohesion	1. Municipality ensure social inclusion of all social groups and take anti-discrimination measures in all areas of policy.	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			yes/no=PI 3CP+3PI = 6
	2. The municipality is taking action to protect all citizens from discrimination and exclusion.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	3. The municipality actively promotes diversity and cohesion in the interest of all citizens by providing resources, support and assist financially the activities of NGOs, promoting dialogue and partnerships between different fundamental social partners.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	4. The municipality has set clear targets for improving social cohesion and maximize the potential of cultural diversity by promoting greater intercultural communication and interaction.	Proven inconclusive.	3,00			
	5. The municipality has adopted individual plans for specific disadvantaged groups.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	6. Politicians and municipal officials, together with all strategic partners, ensure equality targets to be included	Proven inconclusive.	4,00			

	and developed strategies, plans for urban development and public service.					
			3,83	3,60	3,12	
12. Accounting	1. All decision makers are aware of their individual and collective responsibilities, which are clearly outlined in the legal framework and in their job descriptions.	Conclusively proven	4,00			yes=CP 4CP+3PI = 7
	2. The municipal council prepares regular public reports (twice a year) to account for the decisions taken.	Proven inconclusive	4,00			
	3. Municipal regulations include regulations on reporting, motivation and implementation of decisions that regulations are understandable for elected representatives, employees and citizens.	Conclusively proven	3,00			
	4. Access to information for citizens to reports, procedures, projects and other documents (except classified information) concerning the activities of the municipality.	Proven inconclusive	4,00			
	5. The municipality has a transparent system of independent audits specified in the regulations. Validation rules are respected and applied objectively.	Proven inconclusive.				
	6. For the auditors it is clear who is responsible for any decision by the relevant decision-makers and they readily provide information for public inspection.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
	7. The municipality has clear and explicit procedures set out in the legislation to deal with mismanagement and actions of local authorities which infringe civil rights, which procedures are applied in accordance with the rules, regulations and best practices.	Conclusively proven	4,00			
			3,86	3,35	2,71	

Overall average score: 3,60 3,34 2,90

Proven principles: CP - 7 .; PI – 5. And U - none

III. Expert solution

1. Correction condition one (increase) of the methodology: NO

Justification

The evidence does not warrant a higher rating. The same is well systematized in indicators and principles. Self-assessment of the municipality is not lower than the arithmetic evaluation but citizens and councilors.

The average score of the evaluations of citizens and councilors: **3,12** $(2,90+3,34= 6,24:2= 3,12)$

The difference between self-assessment of the municipality and arithmetic evaluation: **+ 0,48** $(3,60-3,12=0,48)$

2Correction Condition 1 (decrease) Methodology: - 10,00 %

Justification:

Not a sufficient application (PI) of 5 strategy principles. .

3Correction Condition 2 (reduction) of the Methodology: - 5,00 %

Justification:

Self benchmark is higher by 0.50 (0.48) percentage points relative to the arithmetic evaluation of citizens and councilors.

Final correction rate: - 15,00 %

Total final evaluation adjustment applied: 3,06 $(3,60 - 3,60 \times 15\% = 3,60 - 0,54 = 3,06)$

29.01.2015 г.
Sofia

signature
(.....)